

**PART FIVE**  
**EVALUATION**



# PART FIVE EVALUATION

## CHAPTER 15 PROJECT EVALUATION

The purpose of this section of the report is to establish the review process to be used when evaluating a project's compliance with the IDG.

### SECTION A GENERAL

---

This Project Evaluation chapter contains the following:

- SECTION A - GENERAL
- SECTION B - PURPOSE
- SECTION C - INSTRUCTIONS
- SECTION D - IDG REVIEW (Chapters 4 through 9)
- SECTION E - CHECKLIST (A Project Analysis Work Sheet for Reviewers)
- SECTION F - SUMMARY (Approval Form & Written Comments)

### SECTION B PURPOSE

---

The IDG shall be thought of as an on-going tool to greatly improve the visual appearance of Fort Lewis, thereby creating an environment which will retain and attract highly skilled motivated personnel.

The reviewer shall first read the entire document to gain an understanding of its contents and structure. By using the IDG to determine the visual impact of each project on the goals and objectives of Fort Lewis, a coordinated, supported and enlightened evaluation may be made by DEH personnel.

Competent design professionals, upon receiving the pertinent sections of the document related to their project, will be able to use the conceptual ideas in the IDG as a starting point

PART FIVE-EVALUATION  
CHAPTER 15-PROJECT EVALUATION

for their designs, and will be able to integrate the Design Criteria into their projects so as to create a harmonious, coherently designed Post.

## SECTION C INSTRUCTIONS

---

**Reviewer: How to Use Section D - IDG Review**  
(Chapter 4 through 9).

This section has been included to provide the reviewer with a brief listing of the salient points made in each Design Guideline Chapter of the IDG.

Each review statement supports the categories listed on the Checklist within each Task. Detailed information is found by reading each Chapter 4 through 9) in detail.

**Reviewer: How to Use SECTION E - CHECKLIST**  
(Project Analysis by Task)

The Checklist has been provided to simplify the record keeping and evaluation process for the reviewer.

The Checklist, a work sheet, contains eight Tasks. Each Task contains a number of categories which are to be checked off as the reviewer studies the drawings for each project. (This information is to be kept in DEH files and not released to the A/E contractors.)

The purpose of the Checklist is to provide an organized work sheet for collecting and tabulating the visual design information for each project. There are separate categories listed under each Task; the Tasks correspond to the Chapter headings. Review of a project consists of eliminating any categories which don't apply (thus tailoring the Checklist to each project), and marking the others "yes" (approved) or "no" (disapproved). In order to refresh their memory on a particular category, users can

refer back to the graphic information in the appropriate chapter. All information is provided in the same sequence.

The user's first task is to determine the nature of the design construction or maintenance project to be performed and the Visual Zone in which it is to occur. As the reader refers to the M-2-A Zone Map, he may discover that the project occurs in one or several Zones. If further Zone clarification is needed, refer to the Zone descriptive text.

The manner in which a reviewer will use the IDG to check a project is described below:

- TASK ONE** Establish the nature of the project and determine the Visual Zone in which it is to occur.
- TASK TWO** Establish whether or not the Climatological Criteria have been met. (Chapter 4)
- TASK THREE** Establish whether or not the Topographical Criteria have been met. (Chapter 5)
- TASK FOUR** Establish whether or not the Historical/Regional Criteria have been met. (Chapter 6)
- TASK FIVE** Establish whether or not the Master Plan Criteria have been met. (Chapter 7)
- TASK SIX** Establish whether or not the Site Design Criteria have been met. (Chapter 8)
- TASK SEVEN** Establish whether or not the Building Design Criteria have been met. (Chapter 9)
- TASK EIGHT** Compare the project to the Prototypes (same Zone when applicable) to see if the final visual result presents an "integrated design appearance" such as was achieved in each Prototype design.

**Reviewer: How to Use SECTION F - SUMMARY (Project Approval Forms and Written Comments)**

This Summary is composed of two parts:

- Project Approval Form
- List of Written Comments.

The purpose of the Project Approval Form is:

- To provide information necessary to identify the project and its Zones.
- To record "if" and "when" approval for a project was granted.
- To provide an "approval routing" list which records which department participated in the review process.

The purpose of the Written Comments sheet is:

- To provide a place to collect the information gathered in the Checklist.
- To provide a place for the reviewer to write a "summary-type" of comment, either positive or negative within each Task Area.

**Reviewer: How to Provide IDG Information to the A/E Contractor**

For the design of most facilities at the Installation, a complete Installation Design Guide should be provided to the A/E Contractor:

- General: The entire *IDG Part One - General Information* will enable the contractor to understand the IDG's intent and to properly utilize its information.
- Guidelines: The entire *IDG Part Two - General Design Guidelines* is to be read by the contractor in order to familiarize him with the Climatological, Topographical and Historical/Regional guidelines. Part Two information will assist the contractor in complying with the features of the IDG Checklist. (For minor designs,

material selection or projects designed by in-house staff, the personnel or staff involved should be totally familiar with this information already).

- Guidelines: The *IDG Part Three - Specific Design Guidelines*, which contains information on Master Planning, Site Design and Building Design, should be studied very carefully by the contractor.
- Chapter 9 has been formatted so that the building design information is treated separately for each Zone in Section B - Zonal Application. Therefore, the A/E Contractor must examine the building design criteria Zone information based on matching the Zone (or Zones) within which the project is located. (So, if a project occurs in more than one Zone, additional Zone sections from Chapter 9 should be provided.)
- Prototypes: There are five Prototype Areas in the *IDG Part Four - Application of Design Guidelines to Prototype Areas*. Each of the Prototype Areas involves more than one Zone. Selection of the Prototype to be studied by the contractor shall be based on matching Zones.

## SECTION D

### IDG REVIEW

---

(Chapters 4 through 9)

#### Chapter 4 - Climatic Considerations

1. Be responsive to local climate in building design.
2. Create site and building designs which protect pedestrians and building materials from inclement weather utilizing features such as wide overhangs, canopies, port-cocheres and enclosed circulation links between buildings.
3. Create site and building designs which

**PART FIVE-EVALUATION  
CHAPTER 15-PROJECT EVALUATION**

protect pedestrians from occasional northwest winter winds and prevailing southwest winter winds utilizing features such as windbreaks, fences, building orientation, building massing, protected entryways, and courtyards.

4. Utilize south orientation, skylights, and glazing for portions of buildings with high human occupancy.

5. Incorporate design features such as covered porches, decks and courtyards to take advantage of mild climate and provide for outdoor use.

6. Utilize indigenous materials such as brick, stone, redwood, cedar, douglas fir and cedar shingles which will weather well in this climate.

7. Use of minimum roof pitch of 3/12 is recommended to facilitate rain runoff.

8. Combine site design and building elements to create a sense of shelter.

9. Choose durable building finishes and colors which add a sense of warmth to environment.

10. Place window and door openings to take advantage of southern exposure, natural views and natural ventilation.

11. Provide shading devices on appropriate building facades.

**Chapter 5 - Topographical Features**

1. Place development on flat or gently rolling terrain, avoid building and road development on slopes over 15%.

2. Use hills and bluffs only for passive recreational facilities.

3. Build only on gravelly outwash soils.

4. Do not remove vegetative cover from steep hillside slopes.

5. Measure ground water depth during rainy

season at each new building site prior to development.

6. Limit construction in naturally marshy areas to protect against increased construction costs and environmental damage.

7. Select building sites and group buildings to take advantage of and to fit naturally with the visual spatial qualities of each proposed location, recognizing the special conditions of focus and containment that exist at Fort Lewis.

8. Ensure that future road circulation systems work with the contours so as to avoid excessive cut and fill, climb slopes on a gradual, diagonal line, avoid steep hills and blend with the natural land form.

9. Provide pleasant, sequential views from roadways and paths that capitalize on Fort Lewis's natural beauty.

10. Design bikepaths and pedestrian walkways to integrate with natural features of the site and adequately provide for the volume and speed of users.

**Chapter 6 - Historical/Regional Character**

1. Preserve open spaces and forested areas; design formal open spaces which are symbolic of military honor.

2. Protect vistas and utilize long-range views of Mt. Rainier.

3. Concentrate efforts on one single design theme, which is the "Military Park Theme."

4. Utilize recurring geometric shapes in land form design, road circulation patterns and building design.

5. Employ the Laws of Natural Beauty (page 6-3) and allow for diversity.

6. Balance designs with a symmetrical arrangement of elements around an axis, especially in Zone 1.

7. Relate parts of a design back to a common center.

8. Utilize designs which are compatible with the historic Georgian Colonial Revival Style which currently exists in the old Garrison Area.

9. Choose exterior building materials which allow buildings in each Zone to blend together with historic buildings and with each other.

10. Limit height of buildings to three stories, and create long rectangular buildings shapes with the long axis placed in an east-west direction.

11. Place buildings in an orderly arrangement as one method of stressing military values of discipline and regularity.

12. Express military hierarchical system by means of size of building and degree of detail.

13. Pay careful attention to design details.

14. Plan parks in conjunction with housing areas.

15. Provide monuments to commemorate important Fort Lewis personnel and events.

16. Provide buildings with protected, clearly discernible entrances.

17. Return to regional/vernacular style of architecture characterized as follows:

- Integration of the building to the site.
- Close relationship of indoor and outdoor spaces.
- Positive transition of building to grounds through the use of terraces with wide staircases.
- Informal character of building and grounds development.
- True care and craftsmanship.
- Articulated heavy timber structure often

combined with stone.

- Integration of gardens and courtyards into building design.
- Shingle-style bungalows with large porches.
- Close relationship of form to function.
- Simplicity and clarity of building statement.
- Direct expression of each material.

### Chapter 7 - Master Planing Criteria

1. Verify compatibility of land use for this project with adjacent areas; all eight Zones must co-exist harmoniously.

2. Review points of access to the project regarding location, intensity of use and projected character.

3. Check to see that the architectural and historical character of the site is maintained by its planning.

4. Confirm that site selection has met the following criteria:

- Compatible building area to site area.
- Site orientation to meet passive energy requirements of the building.
- Avoidance of destruction of beautiful natural environment
- Suitability of soil condition for bearing requirements.
- Acceptable natural drainage conditions in conjunction with an acceptable storm water management plan.
- Consistent land use
- Available utilities

PART FIVE-EVALUATION  
CHAPTER 15-PROJECT EVALUATION

- Workable grade changes
  - Adequate circulation systems. Acceptable access.
  - Adequate space for required parking and hardstand areas.
  - Acceptable safety consideration.
  - Avoidance of visual/sonic pollution setbacks may be required.
5. Protect and preserve wildlife habitat.
6. Protect the unbuilt physical environment; provide greenbelts and natural areas.
7. Maintain (and/or re-establish) dense tree cover on hillside slopes.
8. Protect environmentally sensitive areas and existing springs and wells.
9. Confirm that a "non-cluttering" approach has been taken in the location of utility systems; for example, place utilities:
- Underground
  - Above grade on less significant thoroughfares
  - Along rear alleyways
  - Along rear sides of significant buildings when properly screened with appropriate landscaping.
10. Locate substations and distribution transformers inconspicuously and screen with plantings.
11. Existing overhead transmissions lines which cannot be located underground should be screened from view as much as possible
12. Locate water sewer and drainage services along roadways in order to least disturb the natural terrain.
13. Provide storm drainage systems in conjunc-

15-6

tion with curbs and gutters for all roads except those in relatively undeveloped areas, where gravel shoulders and swales are acceptable.

14. Expand existing street lighting standards to adequately and uniformly light the entire Post, according to the needs of each Zone.

15. Provide flood lighting for building identification and illumination and high security purposes with coordinated light fixture design.

16. Primary Road Recommendations:

- Forms Boundaries between zones, not through zones.
- Curb and gutter in built - up areas.
- Median (15'-0' min, landscaped).
- Limit curb cuts and intersections to major streets and major facility entrances (min 500' centerline to centerline spacing).
- On-street parking prohibited.
- Sidewalks or parking separated from road by sizable planting strip (12' min).
- Medians, lighting, signage and landscaping reinforce importance and high speed nature of the road.

17. Secondary Road Recommendations:

- Curb & Gutter
- Limit direct access to adjacent property (300' min centerline to centerline spacing).
- Maximum 2 lanes each direction (plus turn lanes) with or without median (6'-0" min).
- Sidewalks separated from road by planting strip (12'-0").
- Lighting, signage and planting reflect the

Higginbotham & Assoc  
April 1987

moderate to slow speed nature of traffic and character of adjacent land use.

18. Tertiary Roads Recommendations:

- Discontinuous alignment, except between secondary streets.
- Maximum 1 lane each direction.
- On Street parking discouraged, but allowed in family housing areas when street is wide enough.
- Curb & Gutter.
- Sidewalk may be adjacent to street - six foot planting strip preferred.
- Street lighting, signage and planting in character with the slow speed traffic and nature of surrounding land uses.
- Make cul-de-sacs or loops out of grids.

19. In all developed areas where roads have curbs, provide a raised median in less developed areas where road has no curb, provides a depressed median for drainage.

20. Where intersections are located close together, provide at least 150 feet between intersections or reroute road to allow at least 50 feet straight section before intersection.

**Chapter 8 - Site Design Criteria**

1. Circulation shall be efficient and reinforce Military Park Theme.

2. Orient buildings to respond to:

- Topography
- Climate
- Military Park Theme

3. Separate parking from buildings with a 20' minimum greenway/pedestrian space.

4. Arrange parking to emphasize building entry(ies).

5. Segregate vehicular, bicycle and pedestrian traffic as much as possible.

6. Locate loading docks, etc properly and screen if necessary.

7. Provide appropriate landscaping (formal, semiformal or informal).

8. Use landscaping to emphasize entries, screen undesirable elements or buildings and blend dissimilar building forms.

9. Provide appropriate sizes, textures and varieties of trees.

10. Use shrubs as transitional elements, windbreaks, screens and general greenery.

11. Use groundcovers on slopes, in islands, around other landscaping and signage.

12. Provide vines only in special circumstances on trellises or arbors for shade and ornamentation.

13. Provide irrigated lawns in formal, recreational and residential areas. Use native groundcovers elsewhere.

14. Use flowers sparingly to emphasize and add color to important buildings, signs or areas.

15. Observe care when designing landscaping to minimize conflicts between landscaping and facilities or other construction.

16. Follow Landscape Design Guidelines 1-7.

17. Provide lighting based on need and designed to be harmonious with its site.

18. Locate site accessories to reinforce the military character of Fort Lewis and to be convenient for users.

19. Adhere to signage principals to provide attractive, useful signage.

PART FIVE-EVALUATION  
CHAPTER 15-PROJECT EVALUATION

**Chapter 9 - Building Design Criteria**

1. A building's shape and proportion shall be aesthetically pleasing and shall relate well to the building's context (ie Golden Rectangle).

2. A building shall be massed to relate to its context, express its function, and indicate its entries and other important areas and, in the case of a very large building, reduce its apparent size.

3. Fenestration detailing and building elements shall be used to give a building an appropriate sense of scale.

4. Articulate surfaces to provide scale and reduce visual monotony.

5. Use texture to emphasize entries, reduce apparent mass and distinguish important buildings as well as to relate buildings to people.

6. Provide an appropriate rhythm which relates to context identifies functions and articulates surfaces.

7. Take advantages of the "life-giving" qualities of light and shadow and "supplement" them where necessary.

8. Choose colors which are appropriate functionally and aesthetically.

9. Use expressions of hierarchy to emphasize important buildings within a group and to distinguish one building type from another.

10. Express the appropriate style for a given zone, or area, always adhering to the Military Park Theme.

11. Select materials which will help a building relate to its context and express its importance or function and which are appropriate for the climate.

12. Relate a building to its context with proportion, massing, scale and materials.

13. Tie the various elements of a building into a

comprehensible whole with sensitive, appropriate detailing.

14. Arrange unsightly components or accessories to minimize visual distraction and provide an integral screen where necessary.

# SECTION E CHECKLIST

(A Project Analysis Work Sheet for Reviewers)

## TASK 1 - IDENTIFICATION

Zone: \_\_\_\_\_  
 Proj Name: \_\_\_\_\_  
 Location: \_\_\_\_\_  
 Description: \_\_\_\_\_  
 A/E Name: \_\_\_\_\_  
 Address: \_\_\_\_\_  
 Phone: \_\_\_\_\_  
 Contract No: \_\_\_\_\_  
 POC/Pr Mgr: \_\_\_\_\_

## TASK 3 - TOPOGRAPHICAL CONSIDERATIONS

	YES	NO	N/A
Flat/rolling terrain			
Hills/Bluffs			
Gravelly soils			
Hillside slopes			
Ground water			
Environm'tal consider			
Site spatial quality			
Contour (cut & fill)			
View from roads/paths			
Bikepaths			
Ped Walkways			

## TASK 2 - CLIMATOLOGICAL CONSIDERATIONS

	YES	NO	N/A
Seasonal Temp Changes			
Sunlight Within Project			
Sunshade Devices			
Wind Protection			
Natural Ventilation			
Rain Protection			
Snow Protection			
Sheltered Site			
Building Groupings			
Covered Walkways			
Plaza/Courtyard			
Wind Breaks			
Deciduous Trees			
Vines on Trellis			
Berms			
Building Shapes			
Bldg Arrangements			
Plan Shape			

## TASK 4 - HISTORICAL/REGIONAL CONSIDERATIONS

	YES	NO	N/A
Nature areas			
Formal open space			
Mt. Rainier view			
Design theme			
Geom shape/pattern			
Diversity in design			
Symmet, axial design			
Unified groupings			
Geo Colonial Revival			
Exterior bldg materl			
Building shape			
Building arrangemt			
Hierarchal design			
Design details			
Park designs			
Monuments			
Defined entrances			
Bldg/site integration			
Indoor/outdr space			
Building transition			

**PART FIVE-EVALUATION  
CHAPTER 15-PROJECT EVALUATION**

**TASK 5 - MASTER PLAN  
CONSIDERATION**

	YES	NO	N/A
Compatibility			
Access points			
Arch/Hist Character			
Site Selection Criteria			
Grade changes			
Adequate parking area			
Wildlife habitat			
Greenbelt, natural area			
Hillsides			
Environmental			
Non-clutter utilities			
W, S + G Serv in road			
Curbs & Gutters			
Uniform street lgtg			
Flood lighting			
Primary Roads			
Secondary Roads			
Tertiary Roads			
Road Drainage			
Intersection spacing			

**TASK 7 - BUILDING DESIGN  
CONSIDERATION**

	YES	NO	N/A
Shape and proportion			
Massing			
Scale			
Articulated surfaces			
Texture			
Rhythm			
Light and shadow			
Colors			
Expressn of hierarchy			
Style			
Materials			
Contextual relationship			
Detailing			
Screening			

**TASK 6 - SITE DESIGN  
CONSIDERATION**

	YES	NO	N/A
Circulation - MPT			
Building Orientation			
Parking/Bldg separation			
Parking Arrangement			
Circulation segregation			
Loading dock locations			
Appropriate landscapg			
Landscaping uses			
Trees Shrubs			
Groundcovers			
Vines			
Lawns			
Flowers			
Landscapg/facil conflict			
Landscapg Guidelines			
Lighting			
Site Accessories			
Signage			

**TASK 8 - COMPARE PROJECT TO  
PROTOTYPE**

	YES	NO	N/A
Master Planning			
Site Design			
Building Design			

**Special Comments:**

---



---



---



---



---



---



---



---

# SECTION F SUMMARY

## Project Approval Form

Zone: \_\_\_\_\_

Project Name: \_\_\_\_\_

Type of Construction-

New: \_\_\_\_\_

Renovation: \_\_\_\_\_

Maintenance: \_\_\_\_\_

Repair: \_\_\_\_\_

Date Submitted: \_\_\_\_\_

Resubmit Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Approval Date: \_\_\_\_\_

Reviewers:

Planning Brd

Design Coord

DEH

COE

Yes	No	N/A	Init.

Routing:

Planning Brd

Design Coord

Master Plan

Plan & Serv

Project Mgr

Environmtl

Land Mgmt

Bldg & Grd

Other


## Written Comments

CLIMATOLOGICAL (TASK 2)

Pos: \_\_\_\_\_

Neg: \_\_\_\_\_

TOPOGRAPHICAL (TASK 3)

Pos: \_\_\_\_\_

Neg: \_\_\_\_\_

HISTORICAL/REGIONAL (TASK 4)

Pos: \_\_\_\_\_

Neg: \_\_\_\_\_

MASTER PLANNING (TASK 5)

Pos: \_\_\_\_\_

Neg: \_\_\_\_\_

SITE DESIGN (TASK 6)

Pos: \_\_\_\_\_

Neg: \_\_\_\_\_

BUILDING DESIGN (TASK 7)

Pos: \_\_\_\_\_

Neg: \_\_\_\_\_

PROTOTYPE COMPARISON (TASK 8)

Pos: \_\_\_\_\_

Neg: \_\_\_\_\_

PART FIVE-EVALUATION  
CHAPTER 15-PROJECT EVALUATION

**Notes**